Collision Reconstruction Services within the RCMP:

Is the Organization Ready for Change?

Gerard Poitras

Athabasca University

Applied Project

APRJ-699

Dr. Dev Dutta

July 31, 2008
Abstract

British Columbia has one fatal motor vehicle collision every 19 hours and 79 people are injured everyday in motor vehicle collisions (Insurance Corporation of British Columbia [ICBC], 2005). The Collision Reconstruction Service (CRS) of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) forensically investigates the worst of these collisions in order to determine the events and their cause. The sustainability of the CRS is in question due to a looming human resource crisis that the RCMP is experiencing and will continue to experience in future years. This human resource shortage is also affecting operational policing functions which are critical to maintaining order and preserving the rights of citizens.

It is proposed that the RCMP outsource the CRS function in order to increase efficiency and effectively use trained police officers to strengthen frontline policing operations. Personnel from this reactive specialized policing unit would be redeployed to proactive policing functions which would minimize the effects of the human resource shortages.

This research examined three main issues regarding outsourcing the CRS to the private sector. Before an organization can successfully implement a change strategy it must possess change readiness. This study examined the readiness of the CRS and the E Division Traffic Services (EDTS) section of the RCMP. The study conclusively revealed that although the service’s external stakeholders are dissatisfied with the service in its current state, the organization is not change ready.

This research also studied potential areas of change resistance. It was determined that resistance to change occurs in the RCMP because of its organizational type, structure, culture, and denial in a critical part of the change process, that of diagnosis of problems within a flawed organization.

Outsourcing the CRS was also examined. The research determined that outsourcing the CRS to the private sector is both viable and justifiable. It was determined that forensic analysis and reconstruction of motor vehicle collisions is not a function that is restricted to police officers. Outsourcing the service would require modifying both on-scene investigative procedures and collision investigation training. It would establish a reduced but critical role for the RCMP, that of evidence and data collectors. This new role would reduce road closure times and eliminate the technical analysis requirement for the RCMP, without jeopardizing service to stakeholders.

This research paper concludes with recommendations, such as outsourcing the CRS, hiring a professional change agent and others, that would help the organization to become change ready and overcome resistance.
Collision Reconstruction Services within the RCMP:
Is the Organization Ready for Change?

Table of Contents

1.0 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 5
2.0 Research Objectives ............................................................................................. 5
3.0 Research Questions ................................................................................................. 5
   4.1 Royal Canadian Mounted Police .............................................................. 6
   4.2 E Division Traffic Services ....................................................................... 6
   4.3 Collision Reconstruction Service ............................................................ 7
      4.3.1 Mission and Strategy ............................................................... 7
      4.3.2 Structure and Human Resources .................................................... 8
5.0 The Study Context - Collision Reconstruction in BC ............................................. 8
   5.1 History of the Collision Reconstruction Services ..................................... 8
   5.2 Stakeholders .......................................................................................... 9
   5.3 Private Sector Collision Reconstruction Services .................................... 10
6.0 Literature Review .................................................................................................. 10
   6.1 Organizational Change ......................................................................... 10
      6.1.1 Readiness for Change .............................................................. 10
      6.1.2 Steps for Change .......................................................................... 11
      6.1.3 Resistance to Change ............................................................... 12
         6.1.3.1 Policing as an ‘Organization’ .................................................. 12
         6.1.3.2 Structure ................................................................................. 13
         6.1.3.3 Culture .................................................................................. 14
      6.1.4 Change process ............................................................................ 15
   6.2 Outsourcing of Public Police Services ...................................................... 18
      6.2.1 Traditional and Transformational Outsourcing .................................. 19
      6.2.2 Outsourcing Framework ................................................................ 19
      6.2.3 Future of Policing .......................................................................... 20
7.0 Study Approach and Methodology ........................................................................ 21
8.0 Discussion of Findings .......................................................................................... 22
   8.1 Readiness to Change ........................................................................... 22
      8.1.2 Change although Difficult, can be Implemented ......................... 23
      8.1.3 Change will be Beneficial for Organization/Stakeholders .............. 25
      8.1.4 Leaders will Support Change ........................................................ 26
      8.1.5 Change will be Beneficial for Individuals ....................................... 27
      8.1.6 Change will Benefit Stakeholders .................................................. 27
      8.1.7 Readiness to Change - Conclusions ............................................. 28
   8.2 Resistance to Change .......................................................................... 29
      8.2.1 Organization Resistance .............................................................. 29
      8.2.2 Structural Resistance .................................................................... 29
      8.2.3 Cultural Resistance ....................................................................... 30
      8.2.4 Change Process ............................................................................... 30
      8.2.5 Resistance to Change – Conclusions ........................................... 33
8.3 Feasibility of Outsourcing the CRS ............................................................. 33
  8.3.1 Likelihood of Outsourcing the CRS ..................................................... 33
  8.3.2 Legitimacy of Outsourcing the CRS .................................................. 35
  8.3.3 Viability and Legitimacy – Conclusions ............................................. 36
9.0 Recommendations .................................................................................... 36
  9.1 Outsource the CRS .............................................................................. 37
  9.2 RCMP to perform Managerial Review of the EDTS and the CRS ....... 37
  9.3 Change Agent ...................................................................................... 38
10.0 Conclusions ............................................................................................ 39
Appendix 1 ........................................................................................................ 40
References ........................................................................................................... 43
1.0 Introduction

British Columbia has one fatal motor vehicle collision every 19 hours and 79 people are injured everyday in motor vehicle collisions (Insurance Corporation of British Columbia [ICBC], 2005). The Collision Reconstruction Service (CRS) of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) forensically investigates the worst of these collisions in order to determine what happened and how they occur.

The Collision Reconstruction Service was started in the mid 1970’s in order to improve the RCMP’s investigational standards for these collisions. In the 30 years since its inception, the service has not grown although fatalities and injury collisions have consistently risen in British Columbia.

The RCMP is currently at a critical point in its history in British Columbia. The police force is experiencing a deficit in personnel due to a large attrition rate and may be unable to continue to support specialized units, such as the Collision Reconstruction Service. In addition, anecdotal evidence suggests that an imbalance currently exists between the level of service the CRS can provide and the requirements its stakeholders have. It may be time to outsource or privatize the service so that the RCMP can sustain operations and secure their municipal and provincial contracts, which are up for renegotiations in the year 2012. For the purpose of this study the term outsourcing will be utilized to indicate a change of the CRS from public to private control.

2.0 Research Objectives

This research had the following objectives:

1. Describe service imbalance between CRS and its stakeholders.
2. Describe viable solutions to the service imbalance, including the option of outsourcing CRS.
3. Identify readiness for change within the RCMP to implement an outsourcing solution for CRS.
4. Identify recommendations for planned change.
5. Describe the outline of an assessment process that can be replicated for other police specialty units that are facing service imbalance challenges.

3.0 Research Questions

To achieve the study objectives, this research began with the following questions:

1. Is it viable for the RCMP to move to full or partial outsourcing of the CRS?
2. What role will the RCMP have if the CRS is outsourced?
3. Will the RCMP and the other stakeholders of the CRS be accepting of this change?
4. What level of readiness and resistance exist among RCMP and stakeholders to implement this change initiative?

4.0 Organizational Background

4.1 Royal Canadian Mounted Police

The Collision Reconstruction service is a forensic investigative unit, which is a small but important part of the RCMP. In order to understand the unit’s role in the RCMP, it is first important to understand its place in the organization’s structure.

The RCMP is an agency of the Canadian Government’s Ministry of Public Safety and is considered Canada’s national police agency (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2003). The RCMP’s policing services are divided into five main business lines; federal and international operations, and contract, national, international, and protective policing services (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2005).

The business line of contract policing, internally referred to as Community, Contract, and Aboriginal Policing Service (CCAPS), provides operational and investigational policing services to municipalities, provinces, and aboriginal communities (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2006). CCAPS supplies contract policing services to 8 provinces, and 3 territories, each considered a different division.

The RCMP’s five national strategic priorities are; organized crime, terrorism, youth, aboriginal communities, and economic integrity (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2006). Each division, including all of their respective units are expected to provide value added services which are aligned with these priorities.

4.2 E Division Traffic Services

British Columbia, known as E Division, is the RCMP’s largest contract division. E Division employees one third of the RCMP’s police officers and has a total of 9500 employees (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2007). E Division Traffic Services (EDTS) is special enforcement unit consisting of 574 police officers, focused on providing traffic enforcement for both municipal and provincial contracts (N. Gaumont, personal communication, March 30, 2007). EDTS is directed by a headquarters office and divided into four districts. Within each district field personnel are separated into patrol units which are directed by a patrol supervisor, and perform traffic enforcement duties. A number of specialty units in each district provide forensic collision investigation. These units make up the Collision Reconstruction Service.

EDTS has five main strategic objectives (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2007).

1. Impaired driving enforcement.
2. Seatbelt enforcement.
3. Criminal interdiction (drug and organized crime enforcement).
4. Intersection enforcement.
5. Commercial vehicle enforcement.

### 4.3 Collision Reconstruction Service

#### 4.3.1 Mission and Strategy

The mission of the CRS is to improve public safety through the application of forensic science in collision reconstruction (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2005). This group of forensic investigators determines how and what occurred in a collision in order to assist other investigational units to decide if criminal or provincial statute offences have occurred.

The CRS has two main strategies to help them fulfill their mission. First, CRS is focused on operational effectiveness, which attempts to efficiently use resources. Second, the CRS has attempted to combine on-going training with vehicle testing to enhance officer’s knowledge of the science of forensic collision investigation.

CRS effectiveness is achieved by focusing limited human resources on the following five objectives (Royal Canadian Mounted Police [RCMP], 2007).

1. The investigation of serious injury and fatal motor vehicle collisions where the interpretation of physical evidence will support criminal prosecutions.
2. The investigation motor vehicle collisions of a complex nature or involving major property damage.
3. The investigation of hit and run motor vehicle collisions where expertise is required.
4. The investigation of police related or involved motor vehicle collisions where death, injury or third party liability is involved.
5. Provide assistance in crime scenes requiring forensic mapping.

The CRS objectives and their objectives are not aligned with the RCMP’s organizational priorities or the strategic objectives of the EDTS, as seen in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Priorities or Objectives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| National | 1. Organized Crime  
2. Terrorism  
3. Youth  
4. Aboriginal Communities  
5. Economic Integrity |
| EDTS | 1. Impaired Driving  
2. Seatbelt Enforcement  
3. Criminal Interdiction (drug and organized crime enforcement)  
4. Intersection Enforcement  
5. Commercial Vehicle Enforcement |
| CRS | 1. Investigation of serious injury and fatal motor vehicle collisions supporting criminal prosecutions.  
2. Investigation of motor vehicle collisions involving a complex |
3. Investigations of hit and run motor vehicle collisions.*
4. Investigation of police involved motor vehicle collisions.*
5. Assistance in crime scenes requiring forensic mapping.*

*Denotes no alignment evident between National and EDTS priorities, and objectives of the CRS.

As such, there is no benefit to EDTS or the E Division RCMP to further increase the CRS to enhance their effectiveness or efficiency.

4.3.2 Structure and Human Resources

The structure of the CRS is a vertical hierarchy, which is consistent with the paramilitary structure of the parent organization. The program manager is a senior collision reconstructionist at the rank of sergeant and reports directly to the officer in charge of EDTS. The unit consists of eighteen full-time senior collision reconstructionists at the rank of corporal, who perform forensic investigational duties as well as manage their respective geographically dispersed units. These personnel report directly to the officers in charge of the four district traffic units in their respective areas. There are two reconstructionists who perform support functions in material management and training facilitation. The CRS has fifty five part-time investigators, called collision analysts. These personnel are typically at the rank of constable and are assigned to traffic enforcement duties while providing part-time forensic investigative functions for the CRS. The CRS relies on a combination of work from both the reconstructionists and analysts. Without these roles the CRS could not sustain their services.

The lower main land district (greater Vancouver) traffic services unit has recently moved all of their collision reconstruction units (five in total) into one integrated unit. The new unit will comprise of two supervisors at the rank of sergeant, fourteen senior collision reconstructionists at the rank of corporal, and six analysts at the rank of constable. It is the intention of the CRS to make the six constables positions understudy the fourteen senior collision reconstructionists. These personnel would automatically be promoted to the rank of corporal after two years with the unit. It is hoped that this new integrated unit will help alleviate a personnel shortage in the lower main land district traffic service unit. However, the EDTS is having difficulty filling numerous vacant positions within the unit. The EDTS has, as a result, been required to advertise the vacant positions nationally in order to find qualified candidates but this still has not identified candidates for these positions.

5.0 The Study Context - Collision Reconstruction in BC

5.1 History of the Collision Reconstruction Services

A study that was completed by the E Division Planning Branch suggested the need to improve collision investigation for the Attorney General, their main stakeholder. As a result the CRS was formed in 1976. Initial personnel were trained at either Northwestern University’s Centre for Public Safety, in Chicago, Illinois, or at the Institute of Police
Later, personnel were developed to be training facilitators as an organizational resource.

Sixteen positions were initially established and at present these positions remain in their same geographical locations. Two additional positions were added in 2007 to supplement the original sixteen positions.

Initially the CRS used specific traffic enforcement officers as understudies for non-complex investigations. As the rate of motor vehicle collisions increased the demand for a more complex service has increased.

During the past 30 years the CRS has only grown by two permanent positions, and developed their training programs, held at the RCMP’s Pacific Region Training Centre, Chilliwack, BC. The courses include general forensic collision reconstruction and are provided to both traffic officers from the RCMP and other municipal police forces throughout Canada. These courses are considered Canada’s best forensic collision investigation courses taught by experts.

As a result of the training programs the understudies now investigate complex collisions and are called Analysts. The CRS is now challenged to retain and recruit, and this has stunted the growth of the role.

5.2 Stakeholders

The CRS has five main stakeholders; internal E Division departments, the Department of Justice (DOJ), the public users, the British Columbia Coroners Service (BCCS), and insurance companies.

The CRS supplies forensic collision investigation and forensic mapping of crime scenes to two traffic units for collision investigation to support criminal investigations. They also provide forensic mapping for homicide investigations. Timeliness and accuracy are important in this service.

The DOJ, including prosecuting and defence counsels rely on the CRS for collision analysis in criminal matters. The report and testimony of the CRS officers influences court decisions and therefore must be credible.

Collisions occur in seconds but the residual effect on victims and families can continue for months and years. Victims and their families rely on the CRS to provide information about the collision to help these people find psychological closure. In most cases these people want to understand exactly what occurred which helps them in dealing with the trauma or grieving process.

The BCCS is an independent service which investigates causes of sudden and unexpected deaths (British Columbia Coroner Service [BCCS], 2007). The BCCS uses CRS personnel at the collision scene to help determine cause of death and rely on their reports to verify coroner findings. The BCCS also are the immediate government liaison to the families of deceased victims.
Insurance companies require information about collisions in order to fairly process claims. All motor vehicles are required by provincial law to be insured. When vehicles and their occupants are involved in collisions insurance companies rely on the CRS to provide scene data and technical reports helping assessors assign fault and settle claims.

5.3 Private Sector Collision Reconstruction Services

The RCMP holds a monopoly in the jurisdictions where the CRS supplies the service. Professional Engineers and retired police officers (Collision Reconstructionists) comprise private collision reconstruction services.

Private sector reports are used to validate the findings of the CRS in civil and criminal courts and insurance matters. Their reports may also contradict or expand upon the findings of the CRS. Private firms have been hired by both crown and defence lawyers because of their ability to provide additional information to the CRS reports.

Civil cases are the most profitable for private collision reconstruction. This is primarily where their services are used at this time.

6.0 Literature Review

The literature review for this project covers two main topics, organizational change in a police environment and outsourcing or privatization of public police services.

Within organizational change literature, the themes of readiness and resistance emerge. The literature identifies common types of resistance to change in police environments including; origins and leadership of police organizations, police organizational structures, police culture and, change in a police organization.

6.1 Organizational Change

Readiness for change and a need for change are required before any organization can commence a change process. At the same time, organizations often show a resistance to change despite readiness by its leaders.

6.1.1 Readiness for Change

As noted in Holt, Armenakis, Field and Harris (2007), the model of change propounded by Kurt Lewin suggests that an individual facing change goes through three stages; unfreezing, change, and refreezing. The authors outline a set of actions that could reduce or minimize resistance and promote individual readiness for change. They also expand on a foundation model developed in 1993 by Armenakis, Harris, and Massholder, proposing that readiness is a precursor to resistance and adoptable behaviours. Armenakis et al. require readiness assessment as one step of their model. The RCMP’s readiness level is at Lewin’s unfreezing stage based on the fact that this is the initial step in organizational change. An assessment of individuals’ readiness or resistance is required in this initial unfreezing stage. This research will provide that assessment.
Holt et al. (2007) suggest that “this assessment enables leaders to identify gaps that may exist between their own expectations about the change initiative and those of the members” (p.233). Thus, an individual assessment of RCMP stakeholders for organizational change will assess gaps which could create resistance. If the assessment reveals a lack of readiness and no actions are taken to prepare individual officers then the gaps will produce resistance and the change initiative may fail.

Based on Holt et al., the first step in the change initiative, such as outsourcing CRS, should be assess individuals’ readiness to change. This can be done using both qualitative and quantitative research methods. The present research continues with this approach and adopts as its design a qualitative approach based on archival data and interviews with representatives of the stakeholders.

Holt et al. describe individuals’ readiness for change within an organization based on five empirically isolated readiness factors or beliefs:

1. The belief that the change is necessary.
2. The belief that the change can be implemented.
3. The belief that the change will benefit the organization.
4. The belief that organizational leaders will be committed to the change.
5. The belief that the change will be personally beneficial.

The model for change describe by Holt et al. identifies only internal factors. One readiness factor that is not considered by this model is the belief that external stakeholders can influence readiness for change. This factor becomes extremely relevant in public service organizations. Therefore this factor is highly applicable to the CRS within the RCMP. Although this model of readiness factor is applied internally it could be used in external analysis with the addition of the sixth factor. This research will attempt to describe the additional readiness factor involving external stakeholders.

6.1.2 Steps for Change

According to Kotter (Kotter, 1995), no matter what the organization’s reasons for change are the change process proceeds through a series of steps and can take a considerable amount of time. Kotter suggest the following sequence of steps must occur:

1. Establishing a sense of urgency.
2. Forming a powerful guiding coalition.
3. Creating a vision.
4. Communicating the vision.
5. Empowering others to act on the vision.
7. Consolidating improvements and producing still more changes.
8. Institutionalizing new approaches.
Kotter provides an easily identifiable step by step process, starting with establishing a sense of urgency. Kotter (1995) suggests that the organizational change effort begins when someone within the company analyzes the “company’s competitive situation, market position, technology trends, and financial performance” (p.97). The focus of this analysis is typically on revenue performance, trends in declining margins of a core business, or emerging markets that competitors are ignoring.

Kotter’s views were focused on the private sector environment. With some modifications, these eight steps can also be applied to the public sector policing industry. Where Kotter looks at the competitive situation, within the public sector this could apply to the RCMP securing their policing contracts within British Columbia. In order to do this they need to assess the contributory value of each service. This research will assess the contributory value of the CRS.

Kotter also suggests that it is critical for senior management to establish a sense of urgency to jump start the change process. Kotter (1995) explains that change “requires creating new systems, which in turn always demands leadership” and that “phase one in a renewal process typically goes nowhere until enough real leaders are promoted or hired into senior-level jobs” (p. 97). For the RCMP, leaders who establish that urgency may be the organization’s most prominent challenge. This research will assess the sense of urgency recognized by several prominent leaders of the CRS.

6.1.3 Resistance to Change

Resistance to change can stifle any change initiative. Change efforts could be futile without fully understanding where resistance can occur or how to manage it. Themes in this section of the literature review include unique resistance in police organizations, types of resistance experienced, and management of resistance.

6.1.3.1 Policing as an ‘Organization’

In order to understand why organizational change is challenging for police organizations one must first understand the origins of police management. In her dissertation, K. Charrier provides a detailed background of the foundations and evolution of police organizations (Charrier, 2007).

Charrier finds that North American policing originated with Sir Robert Peel’s six basic principles for policing developed in 1892. After corruption in the early 1900’s policing became structured and controlled following Fredrick Taylor’s Principles of Scientific Management. Hierarchical authority and specialization of tasks became dominate in policing. Max Webber later introduced five fundamental elements for the policing industry;

1. Vertically integrated hierarchical structures.
2. Specialized units and police officers who possessed specialized skills.
3. Impersonal relationships with decisions being based on fact.
4. Recognition through promotion based on seniority and merit.
5. Organizational rules and regulations.
Working from Taylor’s and Webber’s works, O.W. Wilson advocated institutionalization of these elements into professional policing and police management. The book Police Administration, by Wilson, stressed that the keys to policing reform are efficiency, hierarchy, and bureaucratic uniformity. It is important to note that the RCMP’s organization clearly demonstrates all of Webber’s elements and Wilson’s institutional characteristics.

Charrier further suggests that Herman Goldstein introduced Problem-Oriented Policing (POP) based on academia research in 1990. POP was a reform in policing that continues to attempt to reshape the industry. The fundamental purpose of POP was to develop a relationship between the public and police in order to assist the police to enforce laws and deter crime. POP required policing leadership to be reshaped into a flexible management style. The POP model lead to an enhanced community involved policing model called Community-Oriented Policing (COP), which has been adopted by the RCMP.

Charrier suggests that in the POP and COP models leadership must be visionary. This is accurate in today’s Canadian policing environment. Visionary leadership implies embracing change, which is the opposite of transactional leadership. The public is demanding flexible police service which can adapt to the changing police and societal environments. This is a paradigm shift from the previous influences in policing history.

Although Charrier finds that policing has adopted current models she does not comment on the fundamental beliefs of current policing leaders. Many of today’s police leaders learned about policing and worked in a hierarchical and structured environment. Unlike other industries that rely on a tangible product that can be bought and sold, policing relies on leadership throughout the organization to produce the service. It is possible that today’s policing leaders have not adopted the visionary leadership styles which are required for organizational change. It is also possible that today’s police leaders still hold onto the transactional leadership styles, which dominated policing prior to POP. This research will assess if resistance from RCMP’s leaders is because leaders have not adopted a visionary leadership style. This will support the belief that policing organizations are typically resistant to change through a lack of transformational leadership.

6.1.3.2 Structure

Kuykendall and Roberg find that policing structures have been dominated by mechanistic, paramilitary like structures. These structures emphasize specialized units, limited control spans for supervisors, command unity, in-depth policies and procedures, and strict collective and individual adherence to command and control (Kuykendall & Roberg, 1982). They further suggest that these bureaucratic, rigid, and impersonal organizations are non-responsive to the internal and external factors that require them to change, and are therefore resistant to change.

Kuykendall and Roberg find five main constructs of a mechanistic police structure;
1. Specialization requires personnel to be divided into clearly defined positions, which limits personnel’s concern to their own work and not the overall effectiveness of the organization.

2. Hierarchal design of police structures is vertical, which limits interactions and governs relationships between supervisors and subordinates.

3. Authority to make decisions and or influence the decision making process is defined by the persons rank or status in the organization.

4. Mechanistic police structures are rule-oriented, which is intended to guide behaviour and keep outcomes consistent through out the organization.

5. Mechanistic structures are also position-oriented recognition and power is gained through following instructions, and being loyal and obedient to superiors.

Mechanistic organizations are not conducive to learning and change. Tan and Heracleous (2001) find that police organizations which are mechanistically structured are not conducive to organizational learning because of the low amount of discretion that individuals have, restricted communication flows, strict role definitions, and the lack of creativity. They also find that structural barriers to change mainly occurred because of the amount of specialization within the police organization. Specialization leads to:

1. Inter-unit rivalry and disputes amongst specialized units, which work to out perform each other.

2. A lack of coordination between units, which have conflicting objectives.

3. Lessons from mistakes were not shared among units.

4. Information flows being constrained by rivalry and secrecy.

These findings by Kuykendall and Roberg (1982), and Tan and Heracleous (2001) accurately depict the RCMP in its current structure. The RCMP is made up of a number of specialized units, one of which is the CRS, and there is a lack of coordination between units. Personnel from EDTS or the CRS are not concerned with the overall effectiveness of the organization. Because of this personnel from a specialized unit, such as the CRS, would not instigate a detrimental change to the unit even though there would be a benefit to the overall organization. This research will assess internal personnel’s response to change knowing that change would be detrimental to the specialized unit but be beneficial to the organization.

6.1.3.3 Culture

Charrier also discussed the findings of a related study completed by Ward and Ladd (2002) on organizational culture and its effect on change in the organization. Of the four different types of organizational cultures, Charrier notes that some are open to change and innovation but at the other end of the spectrum cultures can discourage and resist change. The author further suggests that police cultures are;

1. Bureaucratic and competitive.

2. Discourage interpersonal communication and personal freedom.
3. Indirectly promote individual goals over organizational goals through the promotion system, which recognizes individual achievements over organizational successes.

Within the RCMP bureaucracy and competition are prevalent. These characteristics are a premise for leadership and promotion. Based on this the RCMP is structured to discourage change. This develops a culture which discourages change. In addition, the RCMP has no structure for interpersonal communication. The rigid rank structure discourages communication between individuals who have the same interest but are separated by rank. Personal freedom is also discouraged. An example of this is the uniformity of clothing, training, equipment, and compensation. With respect to Charrier's third point, the RCMP’s promotion system has recently adopted a combination of individual and organizational goal achievement for promotion. This is a favourable step for their organizational culture.

Tan and Heracleous (2001) find that cultural resistance occurs from the mechanistic and paramilitary structure of a police force. A police organization’s vision and directives come from top management. There is little consultative or participatory decision making, which leads to middle management personnel blocking the progression of transformation or change. Obedience of personnel occurs out of fear of authority rather than respect for people’s thoughts. The organizational culture respects internal distinction.

The RCMP has a distinct organizational culture which is founded on its paramilitary structure and history. As a result, the organization resists change.

Jiao, Lau, and Lui (2005) using frameworks developed by DiMaggio and Powell (1991), Crank and Langworthy (1992), and Katz (2001) find that police cultures have a strong sense of institutionalism, which build a culture that resists change. Jiao et al. find that institutionalism in policing is influenced by powerful internal actors, called sovereigns, and their survival is dependent on receiving legitimacy from these sovereigns.

Jiao et al. suggest that police organizations do not create organizational structures that are effective or efficient. Rather police organizations create structures and strategies that reflect values and beliefs of the sovereigns of the organization. Furthermore, policing institutions will undertake change only if the change conforms to the values and beliefs of the sovereigns. The police institutions will resist any change that is not supported by these players. Lastly, Jiao et al. suggest that even though change is usually instigated from the external environment, if the external factors are not able to alter the belief of the sovereign no change will occur.

The findings of Jiao et al. are reflective of the RCMP and its culture. The RCMP is a paramilitary organization, which possesses intuitionalism as part of its culture. This research will verify the cultural influence of sovereigns on change.

6.1.4 Change process

Organization, structure and culture apply to the initiation of change and their common liability is that their static nature. When change goes from static to dynamic then Zell’s
Zell suggests that bringing about change is especially difficult in professional bureaucracies, such as hospitals, universities, law offices, and police organizations. These organizations are bureaucracies where management controls the core process. People within these professions and their organizations typically invest time, emotions, and resources in their knowledge and roles. H. Mintzberg as cited in Zell (2003) suggests “change seeps in by the slow process of changing the professionals” (p. 74).

Similar to Lewin’s change process, Zell (2003) suggests that “most models used to bring about change in organizations depict the change process as a three-part sequence that takes the flawed organization, moves it through a transition stage, and deposits it in the enriched, desired stage” (p. 74). Three key elements of the change process are diagnosis of the problem, an outcome goal for the organization, and a strategy to facilitate the change, see figure #1.
Resistance to change occurs most often in the strategies element according to Zell. Organizations attempt to move from one strategy to another until they are successful. According to Zell (2003) resistance to change can include “fear of the unknown, disruption in routines, loss of control, loss of face, loss of existing benefits, changes in organizations’ ‘personal contacts’ with employees, threat to power and / or security” (p. 74). These reactions to change reflect accurately the present behaviours to change within the RCMP. However, Zell’s findings pose a gap that the present research investigated. In Zell’s research, resistance to change had become dynamic as implied by a three step process. Zell does not address the static nature of change, which reflects a lack of awareness by leadership that change is necessary. This means the initial step in the three part sequence that of diagnosing a problem is never realized. This research determined whether organizational leaders are aware that change is necessary in the CRS.

Another model of the change process Zell analyzes is the “Stage Theories” of Kubler-Ross. Kubler-Ross’ Stage Theories find that there are five distinct mental stages for terminally ill patients; denial, anger, bargaining, depression, and acceptance. Zell hypothesizes that personnel in a bureaucracy will also experience these five stages when going through the change process.

In reviewing these two models side by side (see figure 2), it is possible that the denial happens in the initial stage of recognizing a flawed organization. Anger, bargaining, and depression occur in the transitioning stage. Acceptance occurs in the enriched, desired stage. The element of diagnosis is linked to the flawed stage and the behaviour of denial, the second element of goal is linked to the enriched, desired stage and the behaviour of acceptance, and the third element of strategy is linked to the transition stage, and the behaviours of anger, bargaining, and depression.

In Zell’s research, resistance to change with the characteristics from Kubler-Ross’ theory occur with the element of strategy for change. However, this research hypothesizes that the characteristic of denial with the element of diagnosis occurs in the initial flawed stage of the change process.
6.2 Outsourcing of Public Police Services

The second part of this literature review examines three main works which focus on private policing and the possibility of outsourcing services currently provided by public police. Themes in this section of the literature review include traditional and transformational outsourcing, a strategic framework which directs outsourcing, and a study of the future of policing.
6.2.1 Traditional and Transformational Outsourcing

There are two types of outsourcing; traditional and transformational (Mazzawi, 2002). The traditional form of outsourcing is seen as a cost-reduction tool for non-core activities in an organization. It has an operational focus, which imposes control and reduces cost without altering the fundamental business processes. Alternatively, transformational outsourcing creates an entirely new business model and management approach for the organization. Transformational outsourcing is a more complex process for an organization to engage in because it affects structure, core business processes, technology, and culture. Eventually the outsourcing must be compatible with the organization's strategic goals.

Mazzawi describes four elements for transformational outsourcing:

1. Commercial leveraging allows the organization to manage the costs and risks of the change.
2. Technology exploitation changes the technology in the organization to better equip the organization with technology that is valuable and aligns both the outsourcer and the organization.
3. Business transformation changes the way the organization is structured and operates.
4. Operational efficiency looks at how customers are supported through efficient and effective business processes.

This research will attempt to identify which form of outsourcing is most beneficial. Traditional outsourcing may not effectively work in the police environment where the hierarchy and work culture are woven into the organization. Police departments required more than a shedding of non-core services. Currently, there is very limited research which analyzes the best form of outsourcing for police agencies.

6.2.2 Outsourcing Framework

Cohen (2001) introduces a strategic framework that can be used to determine what services can be outsourced or transferred from the government to the private sector. This framework is comprised of ten sections of questions, which determine the need for outsourcing of a government service. The questions address political, social, and cultural constraints regarding the service, the tasks that are performed and the capacity of the government to perform these tasks, the risks involved in performing these tasks, the impact on clients, and the competitive market if the service is outsourced.

Cohen suggests that not all government services are amenable to outsourcing. Two main types of government functions that are poorly suited for private business include government service, which does not have paying customers, and police and regulatory departments. Cohen's framework would eliminate the possibility of outsourcing police services.

Cohen's primary concern is that the power to incarcerate individuals must remain in the public domain. However, Cohen does suggest that there are some niche roles which
could be administered in the private sector but he endorses extreme levels of accountability. This project is focused on one of those niche roles, collision reconstruction. This niche police function does not incarcerate or even criminally charge offenders. The role of the police provides forensic analysis to help determine the events of a motor vehicle collision. Based on the identified niche role of the CRS it is suitable to use Cohen’s framework to help determine if outsourcing the CRS is advisable.

6.2.3 Future of Policing

Bayley and Shearing (1996) write about the future of policing and the growing trend of pluralizing the police. The concept of pluralizing refers to the coexistence of public and private police organizations. In the United States, Canada and Great Britain the ratio of private to public police is two or three to one and this has become socially acceptable. This acceptance would support the outsourcing of the RCMP’s CRS.

A trend to use non-police personnel for jobs which do not require law enforcement is also noted in the literature. Both outsourcing and civilian employment are used for this. An independent source suggests the RCMP has 38% civilian employees (Duxbury, 2007).

The concept of outsourcing and using civilian employees are both evident in the RCMP at this time. Retired police officers are hired back as civilians to complete specialized tasks in which they have expertise. Examples of this would be investigators in Forensic Identification and pilots in the RCMP Air Services Section. Bayley and Shearing do not address outsourcing of the specialized function of collision reconstruction. Although it is similar to other specialized functions the have reviewed, each task that has the potential for outsourcing involves unique challenges. This research will examine the unique challenges of this specialized task.

Bayley and Shearing review accountability in their discussion of outsourcing. This is important to the area of collision reconstruction because of the significance of the work to the judicial system, the public and insurance settlements. They suggest that outsourcing will not pose an accountability problem because the accountability lies with the stakeholders seeking their services. It is noted that accountability in general is not a concern but perhaps an unbalanced focus in favour of the stakeholder could emerge. One way to balance this inequity would be to have a public police organization outsource specific services. In this way, the benefits of public accountability are maintained and private competition encourages accountability from the service providers. This research will investigate accountability concerns from stakeholders as they pertain specifically to collision reconstruction.

Bayley and Shearing conclude their paper with a discussion of the future of policing. They argue that the current restructuring of the police industry is driven by the public’s concern for security, the rising crime rates, and the inability of the public police to reduce crime. They suggest that the government will be unable to respond effectively through public policing. What is not addressed is the demographic trend of an aging population producing a human resource shortage. Similar to organizations across North America the RCMP is beginning to experience the effects of this trend. One major reason for outsourcing collision reconstruction is the lack of human resources within the
non-specialized policing roles. This research will examine the potential of outsourcing the CRS in order to deploy personnel more effectively.

7.0 Study Approach and Methodology

The research design for this project was a descriptive study of the Collision Reconstruction Service of the E Division RCMP. It assessed the RCMP and their stakeholders’ readiness and possible resistance to change. This type of assessment can be conducted through qualitative mode of inquiry (Holt et al., 2007). This approach was similar to those used in police and other organizational change assessments (Jiao et al., 2005; Tan & Heracleous, 2001; Zell, 2003).

This descriptive research used in-depth, semi-structured interviews with selected representatives from influential stakeholder groups and current private collision reconstruction firms. Many of the people interviewed were considered experts in their field and provided expert opinions. These experts came from the Department of Justice and the RCMP. In other groups, participants did not possess any expert knowledge but had experienced the product of the service.

A total of ten (10) participants were used in the research. These participants came from 4 of the 5 different CRS stakeholder groups, namely; middle-upper management of the EDTS (persons in charge of one of four different districts in British Columbia hereafter described as managers), the Department of Justice personnel (Crown and Defense lawyers – one participant from each), British Columbia Corner’s Service, and the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (claims adjustment). The final two participants came from private collision reconstruction firms situated in British Columbia. The sample size of respondents is small. But this is appropriate given the qualitative nature of the study and the intensive nature of the data collection technique (predominantly, interviews with each respondent).

Participants from the stakeholder group comprised of victims or family members of victims were not interviewed because the individuals do not possess power powerful influence on the RCMP and outsourcing of the CRS will have a no direct impact on this stakeholder group. This stakeholder group is simply concerned with obtaining general understandings of how motor vehicle collisions occurred and is not concerned with detailed forensic analyses. Hence, any explanation that is clear, logical, and accurate will satisfy these stakeholders, which can come from the public or private sectors.

Respondents were contacted personally in order to explain the project, describe the value of their participation and seek their willingness to participate. Those who wished to participate were sent an email formally outlining the research project and the ethical considerations of the project (see Appendix 1). Participants were then required to return the email acknowledging that they wished to participate. A scheduled interview time was then established between the respondent and the researcher.

Respondents were interviewed through a semi-structured, electronically recorded interview process, no longer than 30 – 45 minutes. The interviews provided information pertaining to the research questions and hypothesis. The audio interview (electronic
version) was backed up onto separate storage devices (external portable drives) and secured in a safe.

Participation was private, confidential and anonymous (with the exception of the researcher and the academic advisor). Where specific information, such as a quote, was required, the researcher referred to the individual as an individual from a particular stakeholder group.

These interviews were then analyzed for themes; 1) the readiness of the RCMP to change, 2) existing resistance to change, 3) acceptance of the outsourced service by internal and external stakeholders, and 4) the benefits and losses to privatizing the CRS.

The method of analysis was content analysis based. The information received from the interviews was analyzed within the context of organizational change and privatization knowledge, which was gained from the literature review portion of this research project. The content analysis of the interviews in relation to the literature review established conclusions for the research project and further established recommendations for the CRS and the E Division RCMP.

The benefits of this research project develop knowledge pertaining to the effective and efficient use of police personnel in a changing employment environment and the readiness of the RCMP to change. It is anticipated that the output from this project would be applicable to other specialty departments of the RCMP.

8.0 Discussion of Findings

This discussion will focus on the findings of the research process as they pertain to outsourcing the CRS work, the readiness of the RCMP and its external stakeholders to change, and possible resistance factor to the change.

8.1 Readiness to Change

In the unfreezing, change, and refreezing process assessment of readiness occurs at the unfreezing stage. Holt’s et al. five required beliefs establish readiness, where assessments of an individuals’ readiness must be performed.

8.1.1 Change is Necessary

The necessity for change in the CRS was discussed with all research participants. Internal and external stakeholders agreed that change is required for differing reasons.

One manager from the RCMP stated that “through out the reconstructionist program we have members who are over worked, they have significant quality of life issues, they are on call 24-7, they aren’t compensated for that on-call process, they have in many occasions, have a workload that puts them beyond capacity” and as a result the EDTS is “having difficulty retaining significant or appropriate numbers within the service”. Another manager of the EDTS noted increasing recognition resulting in an increase need for CRS services, magnifying the retention issue noted above. A growing internal need for the CRS would only further emphasize the problems that were suggested.
above. It was interesting to note that although managers knew that officers were overworked they talked about increasing the duties relating to these officers without addressing how these new duties would be accomplished by an already overworked service. This was an indication that change is necessary however all of the reasons cited are based on internal demands.

Externally, signs of necessity include expressed concerns about the timeliness and comprehensiveness of written reports. A coroner from the BCCS indicated waiting a year for report to be completed. This was unacceptable to the coroner and the victim’s family, forcing the coroner to give explanations for the delay. A representative from ICBC suggested that the delay was slowing their settlement resolutions resulting in client dissatisfaction.

External stakeholders also had concerns about delayed arrival on scene and quality of resulting reports. An example was cited of a four hour wait period for the CRS to arrive. Individuals from the DOJ also expressed concern over the inconsistency of written reports and quality of investigations. Although some individuals of the CRS are highly regarded experts by the DOJ other provide weak analysis and poor data collection, which becomes detrimental to criminal proceedings. Overwhelmingly, external stakeholders identified that change in the CRS is necessary. They were dissatisfied with the service as is and require timeliness and quality, which the CRS have been unable to provide in its present state.

The patterns identified in the necessity requirement were that internal stakeholders note an increasing need with a decreasing capacity of personnel. External stakeholders also follow this pattern suggesting that change was necessary because the service was no longer timely, consistent, or provided a quality product.

An unexpected finding of this research was the overwhelming dissatisfaction from external stakeholders. Strong statements were made by all of them with respect to their concerns about the quality of the service being provided, verifying the state of the CRS. There appears to be a gap in communication between external stakeholders and service providers as the RCMP seemed completely unaware of this dissatisfaction. It may be that external stakeholders have accepted this poor quality service because of the monopoly the RCMP have in this service. It is further possible that the RCMP has not set up a system in which external stakeholders can express concerns. They may complain directly to a frontline CRS personnel but no action was ever taken because these people have no authority to change any element of the service. All of these factors contribute to the need to change the CRS. Dissatisfaction, poor quality and lack of communication all point to necessity to change. As discussed in the literature review it is evident that external stakeholders can influence readiness for change, especially in public service organizations. The overwhelming response of the stakeholders indicated the need to develop the suggestion of a six factor, external stakeholder influence.

8.1.2 Change although Difficult, can be Implemented

The implementation of change was viewed by respondents as a belief that needed much consideration. Discussion against outsourcing focused on the legalities of non-police personnel entering a crime scene. In some cases collision scenes are considered
crime scenes and only accessible by police officers. Private collision reconstructionists would need to enter into these restricted areas in order to collect evidence and complete investigations if the RCMP no longer collected evidence from collisions.

Along with the legalities linked with entering crime scenes, seizing evidence was also thought to impede implementation. However, seizure of physical evidence for criminal proceeding could remain the responsibility of the police resource investigating managing the criminal investigation.

Another argument against implementation was the need for constant service with availability in remote areas as well as urban settings. One respondent believed that private reconstruction services could not provide this service. However, there was no reason given for this belief.

One internal respondent believed that forensic collision reconstruction requires policing knowledge and experience. This is incorrect as there are many private firms providing this service in British Columbia in civil matters.

Lastly, the concern was raised regarding accountability differences between private and public police service providers. This common but unfounded belief was discussed by Bayley and Shearing who find that private service providers can be as accountable as the police. Although this research does not investigate accountability per se it brings to light a disconnection between research-based evidence and perceptions or common beliefs. Accountability is also discussed with respect to likeness of outsourcing the CRS.

The main viewpoint in support of implementation was that outsourcing has been done by the RCMP in other areas, such as laboratory operations. Forensic collision investigation is similar to laboratory analysis in that it was not a traditional RCMP function. Many respondents suggested that a managerial review would reveal the necessity for the service using the parameters of the RCMP mission to provide safe communities.

Another supporting viewpoint for implementation was that the CRS service could be split into two entities. Evidence collection provided by the RCMP and analysis of evidence provided by an outsourced service provider. This split would alleviate the special authority to enter crime scene and the requirement to seize evidence. It would also save the RCMP money in training and reduce the burden on officers to complete technically written reports.

Other supporting views included a suggestion that temporary civilian employees could be utilized as outsourced contractors by the RCMP, that collision reconstruction does not require police training and experience, and private service providers would be better recognized in courts. Private collision reconstructionist would be separated from the criminal investigations and some respondents believed that their opinions and findings would be impartial.

The interview results strongly suggest that respondents agreed that it is possible to implement this change. Arguments both for and against outsourcing indicate that respondents thought critically of the possible ramifications of outsourcing. Arguments against the implementation came from both internal stakeholder respondents but one did think that change could be implemented. This suggests that resistance to this
change could occur internally. External stakeholders all agreed that change could be implemented.

When comparing the arguments for and against implementation it was evident that the arguments against were weaker than those for implementation. The findings suggest that the significant arguments in implementing were that private collision reconstructionists do not have to be police trained or possess policing experience, separation from the police actually would benefit criminal proceedings because of increased impartiality, and splitting the service allowing the RCMP to continue with data collection and the seizing of evidence while private collision reconstructionists analyzed data would actually solve a number of implementation problems, including the need for constant service and entering crime scene. These are critical to implementation because respondents believed that the private sector collision reconstructionists can provide this service, which would result in an enhanced service over that being provided by the RCMP, and it would not create logistical problems during scene investigations.

The belief that this change can be implemented generated many arguments for and against. An unexpected finding was that arguments from internal respondents did not involve an element of fear, such as a fear that an outsourcing service might fail, resulting in no investigation being completed. It is possible that the lack of fear shown is an element of the policing culture. Police officers are trained to be confident and leaders during harmful situations, without showing fear. This engrained façade carries forward into management decisions. It is possible that police leadership do not question their fears or attempt to distinguish their fears on organizational change. Instead, police managers attempt to cover up their fears by creating noise; a defensive argument that may not have weight. Implementation issues and the lack of showing fear are areas that could require further research.

8.1.3 Change will be Beneficial for Organization/Stakeholders

Seven respondents agreed that outsourcing the CRS would benefit the RCMP. Respondents maintained that the RCMP would benefit for two main reasons; cost saving in operations and training, and a more efficient and effective use of trained police officers. The EDTS would see a cost savings in operating and training costs. The redeployment of personnel from analytical duties to operational duties would allow the RCMP to be more effective at protecting society. The EDTS would reclaim the personnel performing the Reconstructionist’s function to operational duties. Also, the Analysts who perform a dual function would now be able to dedicate all their time to operational policing.

Alternatively, the respondents who thought that this change would not benefit the organization had two main arguments; the loss of a career path for affected individuals and the loss of corporate knowledge. It was believed that the CRS provides a career path for the few individuals that enter into the CRS. Without the service these officers would have to find a different career path within the organization. As a result, this change would affect the few that streamlined their careers in this specialty. Since the CRS was formed, the RCMP has gained a certain amount of corporate knowledge relating to the collision reconstruction. If the CRS was outsourced it was believed that this knowledge would be lost. However, the knowledge that was gained was initially
gained through academic institutions in the United States which still operate. This knowledge would still be available through these sources.

In reviewing the beliefs of respondents it was evident that all of the beneficial arguments came from external respondents. Internal respondents did not think that change would be beneficial but provided weak arguments.

The reasons given for the change benefiting the RCMP by external respondents were much stronger than those arguments against the change benefiting the RCMP given by internal stakeholders. Making an efficient and cost-effective organization was further developed than those which promote individual goals being placed before those of the organization. The other belief was linked to the loss of corporate knowledge, which is actually intellectual knowledge shared by the industry and easily re-attainable if required at some point in the future. It was clear that internal respondents did not think that change was beneficial. An explanation for their reaction and comments can relate to Zell’s literature which identifies that change is particularly difficult for police organizations, and Charrier’s literature which emphasizes that police culture focuses on individual goals therefore the concern about loss of career path can be explained by Charrier’s findings.

8.1.4 Leaders will Support Change

Nine respondents thought that upper management of the RCMP would support the proposed change. Efficient use of human resources during an employee deficit resulting in a cost savings would be seen as beneficial to upper management. Respondents also suggested that the upper management of the RCMP would have to be objective in their decision making and that after a managerial assessment of the CRS management would recognize the benefits to their external stakeholders. One individual from ICBC suggested that “senior leaders have an obligation to be honest, transparent, and forthright with their decisions and I would expect nothing less from the RCMP, the Royal Bank or any other entity to make it right for their stakeholders.”

Leadership support is critical for readiness for change. Kotter suggests that creating a sense of urgency is the first of eight steps of transformational change. However, what is not known are the levels of awareness organizational leaders have regarding the need to change. Respondents suggested a managerial review would provide the information that would convince leaders that change is required.

A pattern was noted in that most external stakeholders indicated the need for a comprehensive managerial review to provide organizational leaders with evidence that would encourage supporting change. However, there is literature from Tan and Heracleous to support the fact that the police culture is strongly evident among the organizational leaders. This culture discourages change and so the organizational leaders may not respond as private sector leadership would to the data collected by a review. The leadership may not support change but would in fact come to a different conclusion. Despite this nine respondents did believe that organizational leaders would support change. In summary it would appear that leadership would support change however the type of change is not clear.
8.1.5 Change will be Beneficial for Individuals

Half of the respondents believed that personnel of the CRS would see this change as beneficial for them. The respondents as a whole were not as consistent in their responses as they were in the responses to other research study questions.

Opinions were provided that change could be both beneficial and detrimental for personnel. One respondent suggested that senior CRS personnel would be reluctant to give up their specialized positions because they may not want to go back to operational policing. Alternatively, another respondent suggested that senior people would welcome change because they wouldn’t have to be on-call. It was identified that personnel have become specialized in their CRS role and a move back to operational policing would cause a loss and therefore induce resistance. A respondent also thought that although a few may be dissatisfied with privatizing the CRS, most of the personnel would realize outsourcing would create external employment opportunities and would move from the public to the private sector.

This potential for movement to the private sector raises the issue of police culture with respect to personal benefit. As Charrier suggests police cultures are bureaucratic and competitive, discourage interpersonal communication and personal freedom, and indirectly promote individual goals over organizational goals.

The bureaucratic and competitive structure creates an insulated system where individuals believe that there is no other way to provide services to the public other than how they are provided through a public police organization. The discouragement of person freedom stifles personnel imagination and entrepreneurial spirit. Personnel become reliant on the organization for their careers and cannot envision career possibilities in the private sector. Personal advancement is focused on the internal promotion system and achieving individual goals to better their promotional opportunities. Personal advancement does not include bettering one’s self to be more adaptable to both the internal and external environments. Thus a police culture may discourage individuals from thinking that this outsourcing change would be personally beneficial, which could create resistance to the change. This could be an area of future research within this outsourcing topic.

The division in the results from respondents indicated that a gap in the readiness for change exists with frontline personnel. Some personnel currently performing CRS duties would resist any change in the service.

8.1.6 Change will Benefit Stakeholders (Change can be influenced by Stakeholders)

Determining if change could be influenced by external stakeholders requires an analysis of the benefits of the outsourcing for this group. The research study concluded that all eight external respondents thought outsourcing the CRS would benefit external stakeholders. Reasons for this were timeliness of reports, a better overall service from private firms, the elimination of a verification process, and more credible evidence in court proceedings. All of the external stakeholders thought that private firms would be more accountable with timelines. Timeliness would provide a better service to external clients. Currently, both the DOJ and ICBC wait for written reports and then hire private
firms to verify the findings of the CRS. This two-step process would be eliminated and would benefit external stakeholders. Evidence provided by private collision reconstructionists or engineers would better meet the needs of the DOJ because of their impartiality from police investigations. It was also identified that these professionals are more highly qualified in the science of collision reconstruction than police officers. One representative from the DOJ suggested that “private recons would provide better evidence, which would equate to a greater likelihood of a guilty plea,” providing a savings in court time for the DOJ.

Alternatively, internal respondents thought that outsourcing would not benefit external stakeholders. One reason given was that outsourcing the service would not provide all of the collision reconstruction services currently provided by the CRS. A second argument was that having police collect data at the scene and an expert witness analyzing data later may complicate testimony in court proceedings.

It is evident from the results of this research that all external stakeholders believe that outsourcing the CRS would not only benefit the RCMP but it would also benefit all external stakeholders. However, the internal managers did not agree with their external stakeholders. This indicates that there currently is a lack of communication between the RCMP and their CRS external stakeholders. External stakeholders are clearly dissatisfied with the service being provided by the RCMP but the managers that are in charge of the CRS in their respective areas do not understand the frustrations of their external stakeholders. A lack of communication with stakeholders does not only prevent the resolution of problems but it also stops constant improvement of the service that would meet changing stakeholders’ needs. Zell describes the dynamic nature of change as movement through a three part sequence. One of the barriers to this dynamic process is identified here in the lack of a communication system between those affected by a change.

This is reflective of institutionalism as Jiao et al. and other authors suggest permeates police cultures. Although, the external environment may be ready for a change the management or sovereigns within the police organization are not acknowledging this need. This results in a resistance and a lack of readiness to change. It is a conclusion of this research that although external stakeholders are ready for an outsourcing change of the CRS they may not be able to influence the RCMP to commence the change process.

8.1.7 Readiness to Change - Conclusions

This research examined Holt’s et al. five required beliefs which establish readiness for organization change. A sixth belief, that external stakeholders can influence readiness for change, was added to the research. The results of the research are conclusive that there was overwhelming dissatisfaction from external stakeholders regarding the CRS. This dissatisfaction is not motivating EDTS management to change the service. EDTS management denied that there were performance or personnel issues affecting service to stakeholders. This research has also shown that neither EDTS management nor personnel possess a readiness to change. Although the research uncovered arguments for and against implementing the proposed change and that outsourcing would be beneficial for the organization and its stakeholders, it is irrefutable that the RCMP is not
a change ready organization. In order to ready the organization, communication with external stakeholders will require significant alteration. This change would assist management to understand the frustration that these groups possess.

8.2 Resistance to Change

Specific questions from the research interviews directly assessed possible resistance to change in four areas. These four areas were the RCMP’s organization, structure and culture, resistance from external stakeholders, and resistance from internal personnel. Internal personnel here refer to upper management and front line personnel.

8.2.1 Organization Resistance

This research interviewed two managers who were leading traffic units in their respective districts. Both of these leaders had developed their careers and attained promotions through a hierarchical organization. One of these did not endorse the proposed change, and the other recognized the potential benefits but did not make any statement of endorsement. Both of these are not visionary leaders, which Kotter indicates are necessary for the change process (1995).

Lack of vision may actually foster resistance. The research identified a tone of defensiveness in responses to the proposed outsourcing of the CRS. This is reflective of transactional leadership characteristics within the organization. Since this proposal did not follow the hierarchical lines from a superior, very little if no consideration was given to it. A transformational leader would possess the characteristics to examine opportunities regardless of their source. Visionary leadership would facilitate change. The research findings here support the literature’s description that policing organizations are typically resistant to change through a lack of transformational leadership.

8.2.2 Structural Resistance

The research respondents were evenly divided on their expectation of a change from the RCMP for the CRS. Nine respondents felt that resistance was inevitable because of the hierarchical structure of the organization. This represents an overwhelming trend which is that respondents do not anticipate a willingness within the RCMP to change. One individual from the DOJ suggested that the RCMP “has evolved from an agency that protected the public to an entity that is concerned about self protection.” Other respondents suggested that the RCMP would be inherently resistant of any type of change due the RCMP’s structural properties, such as their policies, procedures, rank structure, traditions and culture. Tan and Heracleous identify structural barriers which are constructed based on the amount of specialization within a police organization. One respondent noted that the CRS has become too specialized and has created a niche within the organization, which cannot be replaced. This identified barrier is a good example of structural resistance.

The opinion that change is desired was put forward by eight of the ten respondents all of whom were external stakeholders. External respondents noted that the CRS is not an essential police service and outsourcing the CRS would be more efficient and effective
for the E Division RCMP. One individual from ICBC suggested that “the service they (CRS) provide is not really essential and I would think that they (RCMP) would go back to their core service of providing safety to citizens of Canada.” The literature provides an explanation for this observation. Kuykendall and Roberg indicate that policing organizations are non-responsive because of their rigid, bureaucratic structure. This explains why although external stakeholders desire change those internal stakeholders interviewed are resistant to it.

It is logical to suggest that outsourcing the CRS would provide valuable personnel to other essential police functions. Internal respondents were critical of this change because they understood it would be detrimental to the CRS and their specialized traffic units. Acquiring this information through the research process fulfills questions posed in the literature review. It indicates that the RCMP’s structure remains hierarchical, mechanistic, and specialized. Any change which is detrimental to a specific unit will encourage resistance from within the organization.

8.2.3 Cultural Resistance

The results of the interviews revealed that all but one respondent thought there would be resistance to this type of change because of the organization’s culture. Participants also suggested that resistance would likely occur from all levels in the hierarchy.

Some respondents suggested that the senior management of the RCMP would encourage and facilitate the proposed change because it would counter the human resource shortage. Alternatively, other respondents suggested there would be resistance from senior managers in attempt to protect the organization’s staffing model (number of subordinates to protect the rank structure within their departments).

Participants agreed that the greatest amount of resistance would come from management (District Traffic Commanders) and the CRS frontline personnel. Resistance reasons identified included RCMP cultural (their beliefs, traditions, uniforms, and attitudes), the fact that management would engage in self-preservation within the greater organization, and frontline personnel derive intrinsic value and credibility within the CRS and would resist any movement to disband the service.

The research suggests that institutionalism, which for this research is defined as an emphasis on the inner organization instead of external services to stakeholders, is evident in the RCMP. Furthermore, the RCMP’s culture, including its traditions, beliefs, uniform, and other cultural aspects establishes the notion of powerful sovereigns. Within the RCMP and the CRS, managers are considered sovereigns, which confirm the findings of Jiao et al suggesting that if the external factors are not able to alter the beliefs of the sovereigns no change will occur.

8.2.4 Resistance within the Change Process

According to Zell, resistance to change occurs most often in the final stage of a three change process, the stage of strategies in implementing change. Zell further suggests that personnel within an organization must go through five mental stages as per Kubler-Ross’ Stage Theory, in order to overcome resistance and accept change. Based on the findings of this research it is proposed that resistance can occur in the initial stage of a
flawed organization. It is further proposed that resistance which occurs in this initial stage occurs in the form of denial, the first Kubler-Ross mental state.

One manager stated that the CRS “is providing an absolute first class service and yes I have not heard any, not one time, any issue of dissatisfaction in the level of service” provided by the CRS. This contradicts every external stakeholder that was interviewed. All external stakeholders agreed that it was appropriate to change the CRS as it was not providing a consistent, timely, or adequate service. This indicates that the external stakeholders interviewed were dissatisfied with the current level of service the CRS was providing.

Similarly, the other manager interviewed stated there is not currently a human resource issue within the EDTS or the CRS. This person suggested that “we are better staffed now then we have been forever or a very long time.” Again, this contradicted what had been identified by external stakeholders. Numerous external stakeholders surmised that the reason for delay and poor quality of the reports was lack of resources within the CRS and the EDTS. Some external respondents also commented that they had heard unofficial information regarding the human resource shortage within E Division. External stakeholders felt that a lack of qualified personnel in the CRS is due to a human resource shortage.

Findings from the research indicate that internal respondents were indeed in a mental state of denial in describing either aspects of the service or internal factors that would support change.

The RCMP is currently not changing the CRS. It is therefore evident that the organization is in Zell’s initial change stage, that of recognizing a flawed organization. It is also evident that both the internal representatives interviewed were in a state of denial when talking about the quality of service, the satisfaction of external stakeholders, and the human resource crisis that the RCMP is “unofficially” experiencing. This supports this research’s proposal that resistance, in the form of denial, will occur early in the change process, as noted in Figure #3. Countering this resistance can only be accomplished by open, bilateral communication between the organization and external stakeholders, which would promote a more transparent, accountable, and change accepting police organization.
Change Process
(Research model)

Strategy Elements
- Orange: Diagnosis
- Grey: Strategies to facilitate change
- Green: Outcome goal for organization

Distinct Mental Stages
- Light orange: Denial
- Light grey: Anger
- Green: Acceptance
- Grey: Bargaining
- Dark grey: Depression

Figure #3
8.2.5 Resistance to Change – Conclusions

This research determined that resistance occurred in all four areas that were examined. The RCMP by the simple fact that it is a policing organization promotes transactional leadership. The organization’s structure remains hierarchical, mechanistic, and specialized. Cultural aspects of the organization establish the notion of powerful sovereigns and further suggest institutionalism. The RCMP remains at a flawed organizational stage in the change process because denial is impeding an objective assessment. The RCMP could counteract resistance discovered in these areas by attempting to complete the following:

- Educate leaders in transformational leadership
- Implement a flattened organizational structure within EDTS.
- Attempt to modify institutionalism and the influence of sovereigns.
- Commit to open and bilateral communication with external stakeholders.

8.3 Feasibility of Outsourcing the CRS

8.3.1 Likelihood of Outsourcing the CRS

Three areas of focus, which help to determine outsourcing, are issues of outsourcing this niche policing function, viability of outsourcing to create a more effective use of personnel, and a future role of the RCMP in collision investigations. Nine of the respondents agreed that it is possible to outsource part or all of the CRS. Respondents provided both challenges and issues pertaining to outsourcing, reasons why outsourcing would be viable for the RCMP and a future role for the organization.

The study reveals that there are five unique challenges or issues for outsourcing the specialized task of collision reconstruction. Three of these challenges pertain to operational issues, one to knowledge and experience, and one to accountability of an outsourced service.

The operational challenges included; non-police personnel at a collision scene, twenty-four hour service, and seizing of evidence. There are numerous non-police personnel who attend to collision scenes, examples include fire, rescue and ambulance attendants, wreckage retrieval personnel, media and in some cases representatives from insurance adjusting companies. Thus, private reconstructionists would not jeopardize a safety or legal risk by being present at these scenes. The police are not the only organization to have personnel ready to respond twenty-four hours a day. An example of this is the wreckage retrieval industry, which is made up of a number of private tow companies who share the twenty-four hour call requirement. If there was a requirement for twenty-four hour service, private collision reconstruction companies would change to suit this need for their clients. Frontline CRS personnel do not typically seize evidence at collision scenes. They will however, photograph and forensically map the scene and its evidence. If there is evidence to be seized, such as a malfunctioned seatbelt or a data recorder from a vehicle, a primary investigator from an EDTS or general duty enforcement unit would typically seize the evidence and provide it to the
analyst or reconstructionist for further analysis. This challenge is again easily rectified by the RCMP maintaining the seizure of all evidence in criminal matters.

Respondents suggested that knowledge and experience is critical in collision investigations. Currently in Canada there is no certification which is required for private collision reconstructionists. However, individuals who are not either trained and qualified through a Canadian police agency (or European / American equivalent) or are a professional engineer will not receive work from civil litigation lawyers or insurance adjusters. This is considered an industry selection process. However, in the United States the Accreditation Commission for Traffic Accident Reconstruction (ACTAR) is a professional accreditation for private and public (police officers) collision reconstructionists. This ACTAR accreditation could easily be the RCMP’s outsourcing standard for possible outsourcing partners.

Both managers of the EDTS indicated that private collision reconstructionists would not be as accountable as the RCMP would. This is disproved by both the literature and by the feelings of external respondents. Bayley and Shearing stated that the problem is not that private policing providers are not accountable but that they are only accountable to the buyers of their service. This would suggest that any private service provider would need to be contracted by the government, who essentially contracts the RCMP in British Columbia. This could be conducted through private-public partnerships, an example of which is highway maintenance and healthcare in British Columbia. It was also interesting to note that the lack of accountability from an outsourced service was not raised by any of the external stakeholders. Many external stakeholders noted that increased accountability with outsourced firms would be an added benefit. They also noted that if outsourced firms did not provide a highly accountable service to the RCMP private sector competition would lead to their replacement.

This research confirms findings by Bayley and Shearing that the niche policing function of collision reconstruction can be outsourced. A 1992 Angus Reid poll found that 52% of Canadians supported outsourcing the police function of motor vehicle investigations, allowing the police to direct more efforts and personnel towards fighting more serious crime (Lymburner, 2004). This 1992 poll was prior to the internal struggle that the RCMP is now facing.

Most respondents agreed that outsourcing the CRS would be both beneficial and viable for the RCMP. This research examined the potential to outsource the CRS in order to deploy personnel more effectively. Most respondents agreed that if the CRS was outsourced, personnel who remained in the organization would be redeployed from reactive duties to proactive policing duties. This would allow the RCMP to be more effective at protecting society. The EDTS would reclaim the 16 personnel performing the reconstructionist’s function to operational duties. Also, the 55 analysts who perform a dual function would now be able to dedicate all their time to operational duties. This research concluded that it was viable for the RCMP to outsource the CRS, supporting a more effective deploy of personnel.

Numerous external respondents indicated recommended that evidence collection should remain a police function but the analysis of the evidence be outsourced. This would eliminate both the analyst and reconstructionist roles from the EDTS.
Eliminating the analyst and reconstructionist roles would remove the myriad of courses that were developed for these functions. However, the EDTS would require enhancement of other courses to facilitate this reduced role. The EDTS could utilize knowledge from their analyst course to enhance their level two collision investigator course. The detection and collection of physical evidence from collisions could be taught to enhance officers’ knowledge and ensure that accurate information would be documented and collected. The EDTS already have a suitable forensic mapping course which most of the analysts and reconstructionists have taken. This course could also be used to train other EDTS personnel. This would expedite the evidence documentation and collection at collision scenes, reducing road closure times for collision investigations.

EDTS personnel would not be tasked with analyzing the evidence that has been collected or producing a technical report articulating their findings. This would improve the timeliness of reports for external stakeholders and increase operational efficiencies. Personnel that were deployed to the CRS could be redeployed to operational proactive policing duties, which would increase the effectiveness of the EDTS. The EDTS would realize a cost saving, which could be transferred to other critical policing matters.

Data collected at the scene by EDTS personnel would have to be shared with outsourcing reconstruction firms. The RCMP would require information technology that is capable of sharing information with outsourcing companies.

The new role of data documentation and collection would suit the EDTS well and allow the analysis to private reconstruction firms. The aspects suggested align with the transformation model that Mazzawi suggests. The transformational outsourcing model would mitigate the negative influence of hierarchy and culture predominance among RCMP personnel and allow the outsourced specialist to work responsively to stakeholder demand. This is preferable to traditional outsourcing models, which continue to be bound by resistance characteristics.

8.3.2 Legitimacy of Outsourcing the CRS

Two elements are required to establish legitimacy of outsourcing, a human resource shortage and sustainability.

Nine of the respondents believed that there was a human resource shortage, which is disturbing the effectiveness and efficiency of the RCMP and the CRS. Most respondents concluded that the EDTS should no longer continue to provide the CRS. Respondents suggested that since the inception of the CRS, the service has grown beyond what it was initially developed for and that the private sector has also changed, which currently possesses numerous qualified forensic collision reconstructionists and engineers.

Respondents also suggested that the capacity of the RCMP to provide this service has changed since the inception of the CRS. There is a deficit of personnel, resulting in fewer people that can be encouraged to enter the specialty. Also, the current population of CRS personnel is nearing retirement. These factors make sustaining the service in its current status problematic for the EDTS.
All external respondents agreed that an outsourced service would provide a better service to external stakeholders. Respondents stated that an outsourced service would provide timelier reports, better trained and educated service providers who are more prepared for court proceedings, eliminate stakeholders contracting a private firm to verify CRS results, and overall provide a more consistent service.

Although some portions of the framework do not apply, the research identified trends which provide responses to several of Cohen’s questions of determination. Capacity to sustain service levels is one part of the framework. This research identified that respondents also expressed concern over the capacity of the RCMP to continue the service given human resource levels. Another critical part of the framework questions the expected output from the activity. Respondents were clear that they expect a service that provides consistent level of analysis in a timely manner. Cohen’s framework also questions the risk involved in outsourcing a service and the impact of a service which is poorly provided. Respondents identified accountability issues and a possible way to ensure accountability through the private-public partnerships.

These internal capacity issues, the external environmental changes, and external stakeholders’ acceptance of an outsourced collision reconstruction service legitimizes outsourcing. These aspects, however, are not part of Cohen’s framework for assessing the legitimacy of outsourcing a government function. Cohen’s framework does not question stakeholders’ satisfaction, which is the premise of modern business decisions, nor does it look at the sustainability of a service. It is evident from this research that given the current human resource deficit, which jeopardizes the CRS’ sustainability, and current stakeholders’ dissatisfaction with the service, outsourcing is a viable and legitimate solution for the RCMP. Cohen’s framework endorses high levels of accountability for niche roles which are outsourced from police services to the private sector.

8.3.3 Viability and Legitimacy – Conclusions

Outsourcing the CRS is highly possible and advantageous for the RCMP. Respondents agreed that both the RCMP and the external environment have changed, creating the right environment for outsourcing to work for this specialty policing function.

9.0 Recommendations

Based on a current human resource shortage plaguing the RCMP, respondents were asked to answer a number of questions regarding the possibility of the EDTS outsourcing the CRS. These respondents were also asked to comment on the organization’s readiness to change and where resistance would be observed. The research was then analyzed through the lens of organizational change literature, which focused on organization change readiness and resistance. Outsourcing of policing services was also examined.

The analysis revealed that the RCMP is not a change ready organization and the management style is not conducive to organizational change. The analysis also revealed that influential external stakeholders are ready for outsourcing of the CRS and would not resist this change. Any internal resistance would come from managers and
frontline personnel. Finally, the analysis concluded that outsourcing is not only viable for the EDTS but it is the preference of external stakeholder. Based on the analysis of this research project’s findings the following recommendations are suggested.

9.1 Outsource the CRS

It is recommended that the RCMP and the EDTS outsource the CRS through private-public partnerships. This combination of private and public oversight would allow all stakeholders to gain confidence in the level of accountability with outsourcing. The EDTS has developed a program beyond what it was originally intended to be. As such, the CRS has outgrown its role and does not align with either the organization’s core priorities or the operational priorities of the EDTS.

It is further recommended that this change occur over a long change period. Zell’s model indicates that in order for bureaucratic organizations to work through resistance in the final stage of the change process, personnel must work through mental states of acceptance as per Kubler-Ross’ Stage Theory. In order for any change to be successful, it must be planned over a long duration, which Zell indicated to be approximately two years. Any proposed change shorter than this could have negative outcomes or increased level of resistance from within the CRS and the RCMP.

It is also recommended that the EDTS continue to provide concise data collection for the purpose of analysis and collision investigation. The RCMP and EDTS are in the best position to charge offenders with motor vehicle act and criminal charges for property damage and minor injury collisions while at the scene. Personnel will still require some level of investigational knowledge in order to investigate these frequent but not serious motor vehicle collisions. However, for complex analysis of motor vehicle collisions, it is recommended that the EDTS outsource this role. The police would continue to document and collect any evidence that is required for private collision reconstructionists or engineers.

An additional recommendation is that the EDTS train all of its operational personnel to collect and document evidence from collision scene but discontinue the analyst and reconstructionist roles. Industry knowledge that has been acquired would not be lost but would enhance the primary accident investigation courses, which would still be required by the police organization.

It is also important to ensure information technology compatibility in order for these two bodies to share information clearly and effectively.

Finally, it is recommended that the EDTS enhance the level 2 accident investigation course to include evidence detection/awareness and data collection and that the EDTS discontinue the level 3, collision analysis, and level 4, collision reconstruction, courses. This will save the RCMP’s Pacific Regional Training Centre critical funds and space, which can then be used for other crucial operational policing courses.

9.2 RCMP to perform Managerial Review of the EDTS and the CRS

It is recommended that the E Division RCMP perform a managerial review of the EDTS and the CRS. An internal managerial review of the EDTS and the CRS will assist senior
managers to prepare the organization for change and determine where resistance may occur within the organization. This review will identify information that will assist senior managers in their decision to outsource. This would result in beneficial for both the RCMP and its stakeholders.

A key component of the review should focus on accountability and a belief surrounding outsourcing accountability as it has been identified that this could be a potential barrier. It would also provide information pertaining to the overall cost savings for the E Division RCMP and outline how personnel are being inefficiently utilized within the EDTS. This would reinforce effectiveness through outsourcing and highlights that open bilateral communication with external stakeholders do not exist, and that these stakeholders are not satisfied with the service currently provided by the CRS. This may also allow the RCMP to realize that the organization needs to foster openness in order to hear complaints which could enhance services in other departments; it would supply upper management with information relating to the inability for the EDTS to sustain the service in future years given the human resource deficit, which will help managers to move past the denial stage that was prevalent in this research; and it will determine if resistance at the management and frontline levels will persist and assist upper management develop strategies to counteract the resistance from these groups.

Without a managerial review, the RCMP will remain oblivious to the challenges and issues faced by the CRS and other specialized departments, most important of which is meeting stakeholders’ needs as demonstrated in this research.

9.3 Appoint a Change Agent

It is recommended that the EDTS identify a change agent to champion the change process of outsourcing the CRS. This could be an external consultant or an internal resource. This change agent would require in-depth knowledge of the RCMP’s organization, structure, and culture in order to successfully implement the changed outsourced service. They must be given adequate power with respect to hierarchy and influence in order to accomplish this process. It is further recommended that a long term contract (three years) secure the Change Agent in order that this person can work thoroughly with the EDTS and RCMP. This person would assist the EDTS and its personnel to work through the change process successively and adapt to the new role of CRS in a private-public partnership.

A change agent will champion and demonstrate the change allowing senior managers to observe and participate in successful change management. The change agent would also bring valuable change experience from other organizations and industries. As an expert they would also watch for accountability beliefs and monitor accountability safeguards. The role would be to optimize the change process while managing issues regarding culture, structure, and organization.

It is further recommended that part of the change agent’s responsibilities be to work with EDTS personnel directly. Personnel will to need learn to work collaboratively with private service providers. It is unfair and unrealistic for frontline personnel to move from being the service providers to relinquishing these highly analytical responsibilities over a short period of time. Additionally, having the change agent work directly with personnel
will assist them to progress through the resistance stage, creating a smooth change for the organization.

10.0 Conclusions

In 2012, the RCMP in E Division will be facing contract renewals with a number of British Columbia communities, including the Government of British Columbia for their provincial policing services. The human resource shortage plaguing the RCMP could contribute to the loss of contracts unless they gain efficiencies and effectiveness with the use of their human resources.

This research project has demonstrated that the RCMP can gain efficiencies by outsourcing a non-essential forensic investigative unit, the CRS. Although outsourcing this investigative unit would benefit influential stakeholders of the EDTS, the RCMP may not be ready to change and there may be forms of resistance from managers as well as frontline personnel. This project determined that although the RCMP may not be change ready, by implementing the recommendations outlined in this research project, they will embrace change and manage resistance with respect to outsourcing the CRS.

This research project was an initial step in many aspects of organizational change, readiness to change, and outsourcing of public policing. Next steps in research could include;

1. Determining what components leaders require to be visionary and embrace change which is desired by both stakeholders and the organization.
2. Replicating the findings of this research on a larger scale.
3. Applying this research to other specialty functions of the RCMP or other police agencies.
4. Determining a workable outsourcing framework that considers stakeholder satisfaction and sustainability.
5. Identifying a stakeholder communication process with the RCMP.
6. Identifying barriers to implementation.
7. Determining why fear is not a questioning response from police managers when discussing organizational change.

All of these next steps in research will move societal knowledge and awareness further towards building a better, more modern police organization.

Outsourcing the CRS is the first step for the RCMP in E Division to determine how to be more efficient and effective with personnel during this human resource deficit. Once successful, the RCMP can apply this process to other non-essential police units to determine whether or not releasing them from organization will be advantageous for both the RCMP and their stakeholders.
Appendix 1

Hello __________

As you are aware, I would like to investigate the possibility of privatizing or outsourcing the Collision Reconstruction Service (CRS) for the RCMP in E Division as part of my Applied Project for my MBA degree from Athabasca University. The objectives of this research project are to further understand the imbalance between the police services that stakeholders require and what can be supplied from the RCMP given an ever increasing demand on personnel and a personnel deficit currently being experienced by the E Division RCMP. The research project will also analyze the options of privatization or outsourcing the service, identify potential issues associated to organizational change relating to privatization in a police organization, and selecting the best option for stakeholders. My project is entitled: “Collision Reconstruction Services within the RCMP: Is the Organization Ready for Change?”

Thus to help me in this regard I would now like to invite you formally to participate in my research by responding in an open-ended interview about your experiences and thoughts about the Collision Reconstruction Service, their stakeholders’ service requirements, and the change that it will incur. The interview questions I will use are at the end of this message.

Please do not hesitate to contact me or my supervisor as indicated below if you have any questions or concerns at any point about this research.

If you participate your responsibility will be to meet with me at a day and time that is mutually agreeable for an open-ended interview for which I will use a digital audio recorder and take notes. I estimate this will take no more than 30-45 minutes of your time. If any of your responses are unclear or I need amplification, I may contact you again for further clarification or information.

Please reply to this e-mail to set a time to conduct the interview. I will consider your responding as your agreement to participate, and confirmation that you understand all dimensions of this research study as outlined in this letter. I want to give you the following additional information as required by the Athabasca University Research Ethics Board.

Risks and Benefits: I am are not aware of any potential adverse effects, including physical, psychological, social, economic, or spiritual risks. I believe that completion of this research will have significant benefit in establishing insight and a methodology in how to assess the Collision Reconstruction service currently being provided by the E Division Traffic Services. I also expect this methodology could be applied to assess the effectiveness of other specialty departments which the RCMP currently maintains.

Right to Refuse: In replying to this letter you should be clear that this is the same as if you had signed a form indicating that “I have read and understood the information contained in this letter, and I agree to participate in the study, on the
understanding that I may refuse to answer certain questions, and I may withdraw during the data collection period without prejudice." You may refuse to participate in this study simply by not responding and deleting this e-mail.

**Anonymity, Privacy, and Confidentiality:** Your participation will be anonymous (to everyone except me and my academic supervisor). I will mention each stakeholder by name in my write-up, however. I may quote from your response and attribute these to an individual in the specific stakeholder group. Where someone’s identity may be discernible to the reader (i.e. an individual from a small stakeholder group) individuals will be given pseudonyms to protect their identities. In all other regards all information will be held confidentially, except when legislation or a professional code of conduct requires that it be reported. Once I receive your responses I will type up an electronic copy of my notes (as well as a secure backup). The data collected from this study will be maintained on a password-protected database in a restricted access area. All electronic data will be destroyed after the research study has been completed. All paper-based data will be stored in locked cabinets and/or safes in my office. Hard copies of research records will be shredded upon completion of the study and any audio tapes will be destroyed.

**Results of the Study:** I will be pleased to send you my full Applied Project paper upon its completion.

In conclusion I wish to convey my enthusiasm for this research and hope you agree that finding and sharing information about privatizing or outsourcing the Collision Reconstruction services of the E Division Traffic Services will benefit not only the stakeholders of the Collision Reconstruction Services but also the RCMP through a more effective and efficient use of human resources.

Sincerely,

Gerard Poitras

Gerard Poitras  
Southeast District Traffic Services (Kamloops)  
Email: gerard.poitras@rcmp-grc.gc.ca  
Telephone: (250) 377-8738

Dev Dutta, PhD.  
Professor, Athabasca University, Centre of Innovative Management  
Email: Dev_Dutta@mba.athabascau.ca  
Telephone: (603) 862-2944
Questions:

1. Do you think that change is needed in the Collision Reconstruction Service to meet all stakeholders’ needs? Why or why not?

2. Do you think that it is possible to privatize or outsource the Collision Reconstruction Service? What capacity would the RCMP continue to investigate motor vehicle collisions or what parts of collision investigation would have to be retained by the RCMP?

3. Would there be resistance to change from within the RCMP? Why or why not?

4. Would there be resistance to change from external stakeholders, such as the Department of Justice, the British Columbia Coroner’s Service or the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia? Why or why not?

5. Why does the RCMP provide this forensic investigative service? Would you agree that there is an acute human resource shortage in the RCMP at the moment? If so, should the RCMP continue to provide the CRS? Why or why not?

6. Do you feel that privatizing or outsourcing the CRS, which would eliminate this unit from the EDTS structure, would benefit the RCMP? Why or why not? Do you feel that privatization or outsourcing the CRS would benefit stakeholders of the Collision Reconstruction service? Why or why not?

7. Do you believe such a change towards privatization of the CRS is expected? Desirable? If so, do you think the senior leadership in the RCMP will support it? What about the CRS personnel themselves, would they embrace this chance? Why or why not?

8. How do you think personnel from the Collision Reconstruction service will respond to this change if it was implemented? How will this change affect them?
References


doi:10.1177/0021886303039001004